

THUNDRIDGE PARISH COUNCIL

MINUTES of the THUNDRIDGE PARISH COUNCIL MEETING 1

Tuesday 21st March 2023 at 7pm in The Norman Wodson Pavilion

PRESENT: Cllr Steve Bosson, Cllr Deryck Dipper, Cllr Brita-May Hawes, Cllr Kim Saban, Cllr Natasha Smyth (arrived 7.35pm), Cllr Joyce Spackman, Cllr Martin Spackman
Clerk: Colin Marks, Clerk to the Parish Council

The Chairman welcomed everyone and opened the meeting at 7pm

ACTION

23.035 Apologies for absence

Parish Councillors: Cllr Brian Taylor (unwell), Cllr Natasha Smyth apologised she would be late:

Accepted;

Others: None

23.036 Declarations of Interest and dispensations

1. Declarations: **Noted:** Cllr Natasha Smyth has a DPI in the Nursery and some Pavilion development matters and has a dispensation as her input is important to ongoing pavilion plans.

23.037 Norman Wodson Pavilion refurbishment contract procurement

The Council met to consider the contract panel's assessment of the tenders received for the Pavilion refurbishment work and to consider the appointment of a contractor.

RESOLVED: Under Section 1(2) of the Public Bodies (Admissions to Meetings) Act 1960, press and public to be excluded due to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted under this agenda item.

Cllr Deryck Dipper presented a confidential comprehensive report on the tendering process that had been followed. This is reproduced below with specific company names and identifiers removed for confidentiality.

1. Introduction

This report assesses the tenders which have been received for the refurbishment works of Wodson Pavilion. It commences with a brief history of the project, followed by the procurement process for the works and then a summary of the bids received. The assessment of these bids is described leading to the identification of a preferred contractor for approval of the Parish Council.

2. Project History and procurement Process

The Wodson Pavilion was donated to the Parish Council 30 years ago and is thought to be around 50 years old. The Council has for many years been saving cash reserves to plan for a possible replacement or refurbished pavilion having recognised its position in the community enabling a day nursery service and use by football clubs leasing the sports field. This led to the publishing of an approved business case in March 2022 setting out the Council's preferred option of funding a refurbishment of the pavilion.

The Council then determined to plan for the works in two stages commencing with the external works. However, the procurement of a contractor in 2022 failed.

A decision was then made to defer the works to 2023 but to seek a contractor to undertake all of the internal and external works as one job in the school summer holidays 2023 thus enabling the day nursery to continue operating without a break. Tender documents were drawn up including:

- Tender Document setting out the tender process.
- Schedule of Works and specifications.
- JCT Minor Works Contract with design obligations for electrical services only.

The Tender document included the scoring methodology that would be used by the Council as follows:

- Price 50%
- Quality 25%
- Reliability 20%
- Proximity to Thundridge 5%
- Total scores would be up to 100.

A contract notice was then placed on the Governments web site Contracts Finder on 25th January 2023 with a deadline of receipt of tenders by 10.00am, 6th March 2023. This notice advised interested parties to contact the Clerk of the Council for the tender documents listed above. The notice required the notifier (The Council) to indicate the approximate value of the project which was shown as between £100k and £140k.

22 companies contacted the Clerk and were subsequently sent the tender documents and these were shown as appendix 1. Ten of those asked for a site meeting which duly occurred and the same 10 companies submitted a tender by the deadline and these are highlighted in green on appendix 1. These tenders are now described in section 3 below.

3. Tender Assessment First Level

3.1 The tenders were opened on 6th March by Chairman Steve Bosson and Councillor Deryck Dipper in the presence of Council Clerk Colin Marks. These were summarised onto a Bidders record sheet. The Council approved a Wodson Pavilion Tender Panel (WPTP) of 4 councillors:

- Chairman Steve Bosson
- Vice Chairman Martin Spackman
- Councillor Deryck Dipper
- Councillor Brita-May Hawes

The WPTP met on 9th March to assess the 10 bids. A scoring method was reviewed for assessing price and this is shown on appendix 7. All of these tenders were reviewed and the following decisions made:

3.2 Unaffordable tenders.

The WPTP was aware of the affordability guidance in the Contract Finder notice as well as the limit of the Council's long term reserve of £168k. A decision was made to reject any tender which was over 20% higher than the Maximum guidance figure of £140k. Four tenders were in fact in that category and so those four companies were rejected.

In addition, one tender, whilst totalling a low figure, had too many provisional sums and so this tender was also rejected.

These tenders have been scored and the result for each were shown in appendix 2

3.3 Tenders held over until clarification on top three tenders.

Two tenders were considered to be within the affordability limit but the level of information and experience was not as high as three remaining tenders. It was therefore decided at this stage to hold these two tenders until further examination of the remaining three.

3.4 Top three tenders

The WPTP determined that three tenders warranted close scrutiny.

The WPTP drew up a list of clarifications to be sent to each of these three tenderers and their responses received on 13th March were considered at the Tender Assessment Second Level meeting on 17th March.

4. Tender Assessment Second Level

The WPTP met on 17th March and the following assessments were made:

4.1 Tenders held over from first assessment

Two tenders were assessed, and after scoring, it was found that the scores would be

below 70 and would not compete with the top three so these two tenders were rejected. Their scoring was shown in appendix 3.

4.2 Top three tenders

The WPTP focused on the top 3 tenders. These tenders were further assessed after review of their clarifications response, including their filed accounts.

The score sheets for these tenderers was shown in appendix 6. The top scoring contractor had a margin that equated to 9%.

5. Conclusion

The WPTP considers the gap between the two top tenders to be sufficient to proceed to negotiate with the top scoring contractor to become the Council's preferred contractor and to complete a contract.

RESOLVED: That the conclusions of this meeting be considered by the Parish Council at its Ordinary Meeting commencing at 8.15pm this same evening with public being present.

The Chairman thanked everyone for attending and closed the meeting at 8pm

Signed.....

Dated.....